MICT-17-112 D36 - D33 28 February 2018

UNITED NATIONS

	Case No.:	MICT-17-112
Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals	Date:	28 February 2018
	Original:	English

IN THE APPEALS CHAMBER

Before:

Judge Theodor Meron, Presiding Judge Bakone Justice Moloto Judge Carmel Agius Judge Aydin Sefa Akay Judge Liu Daqun

Registrar:

Order of:

Mr. Olufemi Elias

28 February 2018

PROSECUTOR

v.

JADRANKO PRLIĆ BRUNO STOJIĆ SLOBODAN PRALJAK MILIVOJ PETKOVIĆ VALENTIN ĆORIĆ BERISLAV PUŠIĆ

PUBLIC

ORDER VACATING THE ORDERS IN RELATION TO THE RECOVERY OF LEGAL AID FUNDS

The Office of the Prosecutor Mr. Serge Brammertz **Government of Bosnia and Herzegovina**

Counsel for Mr. Slobodan Praljak

Ms. Nika Pinter and Ms. Natacha Fauveau-Ivanović

Government of the Republic of Croatia

36 SF

MICT-17-112

THE APPEALS CHAMBER of the International Residual Mechanism for Criminal Tribunals ("Appeals Chamber" and "Mechanism" respectively);¹

NOTING that, on 13 May 2014, the Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia ("ICTY") in the case of the *Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al.*, Case No. IT-04-74-A ("*Prlić et al.* case"), at the request of the Registrar of the ICTY,² ordered Mr. Slobodan Praljak ("Praljak") to reimburse the ICTY €2,807,611.10 for the costs the ICTY sustained in providing him with legal aid;³

NOTING that, on 26 October 2016, the Appeals Chamber of the ICTY considered that Praljak has failed to reimburse the ICTY, reiterated his obligation to do so, and again ordered him to reimburse the ϵ 2,807,611.10 owed to the ICTY;⁴

NOTING that, on 6 September 2017, the Appeals Chamber of the ICTY considered that Praljak had taken no action to reimburse the ICTY and ordered, *inter alia*, Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Republic of Croatia to take appropriate steps to freeze Praljak's assets in their territories, and to ensure that this order be enforceable in their respective domestic jurisdictions;⁵

NOTING that, on 22 November 2017, the Appeals Chamber of the ICTY instructed the Registrar of the ICTY to take all necessary steps to ensure that the Mechanism is apprised of the outstanding matter of the recovery of funds from Praljak, totalling \in 3,020,542.75, which encompasses his defence for pre-trial, trial, and appellate proceedings;⁶

NOTING the submission filed on 27 November 2017, confirming that the Registry of the ICTY was in the process of handing over the matter to the Mechanism;⁷

NOTING the issuance of the appeal judgement in the *Prlić et al.* case and the death of Praljak on 29 November 2017:⁸

MICT-12-117

¹ Order Assigning Judges to a Case Before the Appeals Chamber, 24 January 2018 (confidential and *ex parte*).

² Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Registrar's Application for the Recovery of Legal Aid Funds, 20 January 2014 (public with confidential and *ex parte* annex).

³ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Order on the Registrar's Application Pursuant to Rule 45(E) of the Rules, 13 May 2014 ("Order of 13 May 2014"), paras. 1, 24.

⁴ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Order Concerning Non-Receipt of Funds, 26 October 2016 ("Order of 26 October 2016"), pp. 1, 2. The Appeals Chamber of the ICTY further warned Praljak that, should he fail to comply with the Order of 26 October 2016, "all appropriate action for its enforcement and the recovery of the amount due" will be taken. See Order of 26 October 2016, p. 2.

⁵ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Order to Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Republic of Croatia Pursuant to Article 29, 6 September 2017 (confidential) ("Order of 6 September 2017"), pp. 2, 4.

⁶ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Instruction to Registrar on Recovery of Legal Aid Funds, 22 November 2017, p. 2.

⁷ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Deputy Registrar's Submission Concerning the Recovery of Legal Aid Funds, 27 November 2017, paras. 1, 2.

34

NOTING that the ICTY ceased its judicial functions on 30 November 2017 and can no longer pursue the matter;⁹

NOTING the confidential and *ex parte* submissions of the Prosecutor's Office of Bosnia and Herzegovina filed on 11 January 2018 in response to the Order of 6 September 2017;¹⁰

NOTING that, on 14 February 2018, the Registrar filed a confidential and *ex parte* submission stating that he has conducted his own investigations, and considered that: (i) regarding potential assets in the Republic of Croatia: since Praljak transferred the majority of his assets in 2001 and 2004 without being challenged within the three-year limit, his inherited estate is minimal in value, "the likelihood of collection of the funds is therefore minimal", and the procedures to do so would take between five to eight years; and (ii) regarding potential assets in Bosnia and Herzegovina: according to its domestic law, such a recovery could only result from criminal proceedings that had been held before local courts;¹¹

NOTING that the Registrar would not recommend pursuing the recovery of the remaining funds in domestic proceedings given the "low likelihood" of recovering its vast majority and the "expected length of time of such a process";¹²

NOTING FURTHER the Registrar's recommendation that the Appeals Chamber should therefore annul the Orders of 13 May 2014 and 6 September 2017;¹³

CONSIDERING that Praljak was personally ordered to reimburse the totality of the amount owed for his defence in the *Prlić et al.* case,¹⁴ and the change in circumstances following his death;

CONSIDERING the Submissions of the Registrar, in particular, the "low likelihood" to recover the vast majority of the funds, the expected length of time for such a process, and his consequent recommendation to not pursue its recovery in domestic proceedings;¹⁵

⁸ Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Judgement, 29 November 2017 (public with confidential Annex); Statement on passing of Slobodan Praljak, 29 November 2017, <u>http://www.icty.org/en/press/statement-on-passing-of-slobodan-praljak</u> (accessed 19 February 2018).

⁹ See U.N. Doc. A/72/266 & S/2017/662, 1 August 2017, para. 80; U.N. Doc. S/Res/2329 (2016), 19 December 2016, paras. 2, 4. ¹⁰ The Republic of Croatia filed its submissions following the Order of 6 September 2017 before the ICTY on 9 October

¹⁰ The Republic of Croatia filed its submissions following the Order of 6 September 2017 before the ICTY on 9 October 2017. See Prosecutor v. Jadranko Prlić et al., Case No. IT-04-74-A, Submissions of the Republic of Croatia, 9 October 2017 (confidential and ex parte).

¹¹ Registrar's Submission Concerning the Recovery of Legal Aid Funds, 14 February 2018, (confidential and *ex parte* with a confidential and *ex parte* Annex) ("Submissions of the Registrar"), paras. 2-5, Annex.

¹² Submissions of the Registrar, para. 5.

¹³ Submissions of the Registrar, paras. 5, 6.

¹⁴ See Order of 26 October 2016, p. 2; Order of 13 May 2014, para. 24.

¹⁵ See Submissions of the Registrar, para. 5.

33

CONSIDERING that, in the specific circumstances of this case, it is prudent to vacate the Orders of 13 May 2014 and 6 September 2017, as recommended by the Registrar;

CONSIDERING that the Order of 26 October 2016 was issued against Praljak in relation to the same matter;

PURSUANT to Rules 31(B), 55 and 131 of the Rules of Procedures and Evidence of the Mechanism;

HEREBY VACATES the Orders of 13 May 2014, 26 October 2016, and 6 September 2017.

Done in English and French, the English version being authoritative.

Done this 28th day of February 2018, At The Hague, The Netherlands.

Judge Theodor Meron Presiding Judge

[Seal of the Mechanism]



TRANSMISSION SHEET FOR FILING OF DOCUMENTS WITH THE MECHANISM FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS/ FICHE DE TRANSMISSION POUR LE DÉPÔT DE DOCUMENTS DEVANT LE MÉCANISME POUR LES TRIBUNAUX PÉNAUX INTERNATIONAUX

I - FILING INFORMATION / INFORMATIONS GÉNÉRALES

To/ À :	MICT Registry/ Gref	fe du MTPI	Arusha/ Arusha	The Hague/ La Haye		
From/ De :	Chambers/ Chambre	Defence/ Défense	Prosecutio Bureau du Pro	—		
Case Name/ Affaire :	Prosecutor v. Prlić et al. Case Number/ MICT-17-112 Affaire nº :					
Date Created/ Daté du :	28 February 2018	Date transmitted/ Transmis le :	28 February 2018	No. of Pages/ 4 Nombre de pages :		
Original Language / Langue de l'original :	English/ Anglais	French/ 🗌 Kiny Français	arwanda 🗌 B/C/S	☐ Other/ <i>Autre</i> (specify/ <i>préciser</i>) :		
Title of Document/ <i>Titre du document</i> :	ORDER VACATING THE ORDERS IN RELATION TO THE RECOVERY OF LEGAL AID FUNDS					
Classification Level/ Catégories de classification :	☑ Unclassified/ □ Ex Parte Defence excluded/ Défense exclue Non classifié □ Ex Parte Prosecution excluded/ Bureau du Procureur exclu □ Confidential/ □ Ex Parte R86(H) applicant excluded/ Art. 86 H) requérant exclu □ Confidential/ □ Ex Parte Amicus Curiae excluded/ Art. 86 H) requérant exclu □ Strictly Confidential/ □ Ex Parte Amicus Curiae excluded/ Amicus curiae exclu □ Strictly Confidential/ □ Ex Parte other exclusion/ autre(s) partie(s) exclue(s) Strictement confidentiel □ (specify/préciser) :					
Document type/ <i>Type de document</i> :	Motion/ Requête Decision/ Décision	Submission from Écritures déposées Submission from Écritures déposées	par des parties n non-parties/	Indictment/ Acte d'accusation Warrant/ Mandat		
	 ☑ Order/ <i>Ordonnance</i> ☑ Judgement/ <i>Jugement/Arrêt</i> 	Book of Authorit Recueil de sources Affidavit/ Déclaration sous se		☐ Notice of Appeal/ <i>Acte d'appel</i>		
II - TRANSLAT	ION STATUS ON T	HE FILING DATE/	ÉTAT DE LA TRADU	ICTION AU JOUR DU DÉPÔT		
Translation not required/ La traduction n'est pas requise						
Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and requests the Registry to translate/ La partie déposante ne soumet que l'original et sollicite que le Greffe prenne en charge la traduction : (Word version of the document is attached/ La version Word est jointe)						
English/ Anglais	⊠ Frenc <i>Fran</i> ç	_ ,	nda 🛛 B/C/S	Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :		
Filing Party hereby submits both the original and the translated version for filing, as follows/ La partie déposante soumet l'original et la version traduite aux fins de dépôt, comme suit :						
-	nglish/	·	nda 🗌 B/C/S	Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :		
	nglish/	-	nda 🗌 B/C/S	Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :		
☐ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s)/ La partie déposante soumettra la (les) version(s) traduite(s) sous peu, dans la (les) langue(s) suivante(s) :						
English/ Anglais	☐ Frenc <i>Français</i>		nda 🗌 B/C/S	Other/Autre (specify/préciser) :		

Send completed transmission sheet to/ *Veuillez soumettre cette fiche dûment remplie à :* <u>IudicialFilingsArusha@un.org</u> OR/OU <u>IudicialFilingsHague@un.org</u>